

Adams County
LEGAL JOURNAL

Containing Opinions handed down in the 51st Judicial District and by
the Judges of that District sitting in other Districts.

VOLUME XLI

Reported by
JOHN W. PHILLIPS, ESQ.
Gettysburg, Pennsylvania

Published by
ADAMS COUNTY BAR ASSOCIATION
Gettysburg, Pennsylvania

Distributed by
WM. W. GAUNT & SONS, INC.
Holmes Beach, Florida

Copyright 1999

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS CARD NO. 61-16583

Judges of the 51st
Judicial District
Adams County

HONORABLE OSCAR F. SPICER
HONORABLE JOHN D. KUHN
HONORABLE ROBERT G. BIGHAM

Gettysburg

TABLE OF CASES

REPORTED IN THIS VOLUME

	Page
Allstate Insurance Co., Herr, et ux. vs.	1
American States Insurance Co. vs. Snader Estate	53
Antrim 1844 vs. Flowers	89
Armatha Marie Ford, an Alleged Incapacitated Person	199
Atwell, Commonwealth vs.	285
Baldwin Estate vs. Baldwin et al	17
Baldwin et al, Baldwin Estate vs.	17
Berwick Township Municipal Authority et al, Nassaux-Hemsley vs.	245
Binder vs. Null et al	251
Bothe vs. Ricker et al	297
Bowman vs. S&M Enterprises.....	81
Brown, Losh vs.	223
Byank vs. Ski Liberty et al.....	275
Commonwealth vs. Atwell	285
Commonwealth vs. Crebbs	155
Commonwealth vs. Daves	5
Commonwealth vs. Dickinson.....	33, 135
Commonwealth vs. Dyer	193
Commonwealth vs. Green, Betty Jean	101
Commonwealth vs. Green, Eddie Ray	229
Commonwealth vs. Harrison	21
Commonwealth vs. Lewis	129
Commonwealth vs. Livingston	31
Commonwealth vs. Powell.....	265
Commonwealth vs. Ramirez	247
Commonwealth vs. Reilly	77
Commonwealth vs. Shelton	151
Commonwealth vs. Vega	9
Commonwealth vs. Voycheske.....	257
Commonwealth vs. Wellman	233
Condemnation of Sewer Right of Way in Conewago Township	147
Crabbs vs. Keagy	95
Crebbs, Commonwealth vs.	155
Daves, Commonwealth vs.....	5
Davis & McKean et al, Kelaco vs.....	237
Dickinson, Commonwealth vs.	33, 135
Ditzler et al, Kiel vs.	25
Dosch v. Hubbell, Inc. et al	39
Dyer, Commonwealth vs.....	193

	Page
Emerson Gearing, et al, Zefer Operations vs.	45
Flowers, Antrim 1844 vs.	89
(Armatha Marie) Ford, an Alleged Incapacitated Person	199
General Motors vs. Keller	125
Gettysburg Construction Co. vs. Griffo	107
Goble, Woolridge vs.	197
Green (Betty Jean), Commonwealth vs.	101
Green (Eddie Ray), Commonwealth vs.	229
Griffo, Gettysburg Construction Co. vs.	107
Harrison, Commonwealth vs.	21
Herr et ux. vs. Allstate Insurance Co.	1
(The) Herr's Ridge Development Co. et al, Martin et al vs.	173
Hubbell, Inc. et al, Dosch vs.	39
Jones et al, Routsong vs.	183
Justice, et al vs. Mount Joy Township Zoning Hearing Board	57
Keagy, Crabbs vs.	95
Kelaco vs. Davis & McKean et al	237
Keller, General Motors vs	125
Kelley et al vs. Mount Joy Township Zoning Hearing Board et al	161
Kiel vs. Ditzler et al	25
Kiessling vs. Shorb, Terhorst vs.	103
Koutch, Williams vs.	215
Krug vs. Sullivan	169
Kuhn et al, Lewis vs.	260
Kuhn vs. Rickrode et al	119
Lewis, Commonwealth vs.	129
Lewis vs. Kuhn et al	260
Linebaugh, Sanders et al vs.	115
Livingston, Commonwealth vs.	31
Losh vs. Brown	223
Martin et al vs. The Herr's Ridge Development Co. et al	173
McLaughlin vs. Walls	13
Mickiewicz et al, Valentine vs.	72
Miller vs. Miller	279
Miller, Newman vs.	303
Moats vs. Stahl	292

	Page
(O.F.) Mossberg et al, Wilson vs.....	91
Mount Joy Township Zoning Hearing Board, Justice, et al vs.	57
Mount Joy Township Zoning Hearing Board et al, Kelley et al vs.	161
Nassaux-Hemsley vs. Berwick Township Municipal Authority et al	245
Newman vs. Miller.....	303
Null et al, Binder vs.	251
O.F. Mossberg et al, Wilson vs.	91
Powell, Commonwealth vs.	265
Ramirez, Commonwealth vs.	247
Reilly, Commonwealth vs.	77
Ricker, Bothe vs.	297
Rickrode et al, Kuhn vs.	119
Robert A. Wills, an Alleged Incapacitated Person.....	141, 179
Routsong vs. Jones et al.....	183
S&M Enterprises, Bowman vs.	81
Sanders et al vs. Linebaugh	115
Shelton, Commonwealth vs.	151
Shorb, Terhorst vs. Kiessling vs.	103
Ski Liberty et al, Byank vs.	275
Smith vs. Smith	61
Snader Estate, American States Insurance Co. vs.....	53
Stahl, Moats vs.	292
Stambaugh vs. Weidner	71
Sterner vs. Wagner	85
Sullivan, Krug vs.....	169
Terhorst vs. Kiessling vs. Shorb.....	103
The Herr's Ridge Development Co. et al, Martin vs.	173
Valentine vs. Mickiewicz et al	72
Vega, Commonwealth vs.....	9
Voycheske, Commonwealth vs.	257
Wagner, Sterner vs.....	85
Walls, McLaughlin vs.	13
Weidner, Stambaugh vs.	71
Wellman, Commonwealth vs.	233
Williams vs. Koutch	215

	Page
(Robert A.) Wills, an Alleged Incapacitated Person	141, 179
Wilson vs. O.F. Mossberg et al	91
Woolridge vs. Goble.....	197
Yeager Estate	219
Yingling Estate vs. Yingling et al.....	205
Yingling et al, Yingling Estate vs.	205
Zefer Operations vs. Emerson Gearing, et al.....	45

INDEX

VOLUME 41 1999-2000

A		Page
Action in Ejectment		
action to quiet title distinguished.....		183
Administrative Law		
discretionary act; court's standard of review.....		147
Adverse Possession		
elements		119
grantees of life tenant and remaindermen;		
when right of action accrues		119
initial non-adverse entry; break in privity required.....		119
Agency		
agent's duties		179
power of attorney creates an agency relationship and		
agency law controls		179
Animals		
torts; vicious propensities, not necessarily acts, give notice to		
owner; no "one free bite" rule in PA		223
Arbitration		
arbitration agreements subject to principals of		
contract interpretation		107
common-law; decision can be disputed only for reasons in		
Uniform Arbitration Act, 42 Pa.C.S.A. Section 7341		107
Uniform Arbitration Act; failure to specifically refer to same		
considered selection of common-law arbitration.....		107
vacation of award		
partial arbitrator		53
power found in Section 7314 of Uniform Arbitration Act, not		
Section 7302		53
Attorneys		
fees; exceptions to general rule of non-recovery.....		215
ineffective assistance of counsel; Post-Conviction Review Act		
claim not waived if petitioner alleges previous counsel		
ineffective for not pursuing it		265
petitioner's burden	129,	265
presumption of effectiveness; standard		265
B		
Builders		
ability to recover for extra work done under oral agreement		215
C		
Child Support		
earning capacity; court must consider all financial resources, not		
just actual income, to determine		303

lump-sum Workmen’s Compensation benefit; court has discretion to determine most-appropriate method for imputing award as income; averaging over 12-month period is acceptable	303
Civil Procedure	
collateral estoppel	
effect of administrative decision	45
entity rendering decision immaterial	45
previous litigation	
consent and default judgments not included	45
defined	45
res judicata compared	45
complaint	
court’s discretion to review for sufficient detail	251
function	251
requirement of conciseness and specificity	297
broadly interpreted	297
conditions to meet	297
counterclaim; standard to decide objections	215
joinder of additional defendants	
after 60 days.....	72
effect of settlement efforts in meantime	72
standard	260
broadly interpreted to promote judicial economy.....	260
jurisdiction; PA Longarm Statute	197
preliminary objections	
court may overrule in favor of discovery if pleadings inform party of what it will be required to meet at trial	215
impertinent or scandalous matter; defined.....	169
res judicata	
collateral estoppel; compared	45
previous litigation; defined	45
Rules of Civil Procedure	
1010(a); broadly interpreted	297
1035.2; summary judgment	25, 39
1035.3; plaintiff may supplement record after motion filed	39
2252(a)	
broadly interpreted to promote judicial economy	260
joinder of additional defendants; standard	260
standing	
“direct”, “immediate”, “substantial” interests; defined.....	141
indispensable party; defined	183
requirements.....	141, 179
venue; motion to change; petitioner’s burden	45
Collateral Estoppel—see under Civil Procedure, above	
Constitutional Law	
full faith and credit; MD “probation before judgment” program not a conviction for purposes of PA driver’s license	
revocation.....	247

Contracts

arbitration agreements; subject to principals of contract	
interpretation	107
breach	
elements	297
payee may seek legal and equitable remedies	279
tort action; when available	45
duress; complainant's remedies	89
executory; defined	169
insurance policy; bad faith claim; assignability	1
interpretation	
ambiguous language; parol evidence rule inapplicable	205
construction is a matter of law	237
extrinsic evidence allowed only if contract language	
ambiguous	237
integration clause indicating agreement is confined to a single	
writing bars consideration of other writings	237
language; plain and ordinary meaning controls	107, 205
parties' intent can be determined only from express language	
of agreement	237
primary purpose is to effect parties' intent	173
marriage settlement or property agreements subject to law of	
contracts	205
parol evidence rule	
defined	279
inapplicable to ambiguous language	205
performance; each party must refrain from injuring other's right	
to receive benefit of agreement	237
survive a party absent peculiar skills or distinctly personal	
considerations	205

Criminal Law

arrest	
defined	155
probable cause; standard of review	31
warrant affidavits; not subject to overly technical	
interpretation	31
cross examination	
bias or interest	135
extends beyond direct examination and includes the right to	
examine the witness on any facts tending to refute inferences	
or deductions arising from matters testified to on direct	
examination	21
demurrer; standard to sustain	155, 285
directed verdict; standard to grant	285
evidence	
consciousness of guilt; acts and admissions by conduct	
tending to show same are admissible	285
cross-examination	
allowed beyond scope of direct examination	21

includes facts tending to refute inferences and deductions	
from matters testified to on direct examination.....	21
other crimes	33
remoteness in time.....	33
when relevant.....	33
sexual abuse claims made after lengthy delay;	
value of corroboration	33
validity of foreign search; foreign law controls	9
identification	
lineup; constitutional right to same unclear; standard to	
compel	151
must be beyond a reasonable doubt; however circumstantial	
evidence allowed and same may solely support	
conviction	285
does not have to be positive and any uncertainty or	
indefiniteness goes to weight	285
open-court	
standard to admit	151
suggestiveness only one factor to determine reliability	151
informants; confidential	
disclosure of identity	
discretionary with court.....	229
standard to compel	229
test	229
qualified privilege protects identity	229
lineup; constitutional right to same unclear; standard to compel ..	151
Post-Conviction Relief Act—see separate topic, below	
preliminary hearing	
Commonwealth's burden	21
credibility not in issue	21
no constitutional right to same	21
purpose.....	21
resisting arrest	
elements	155
underlying arrest	
determination of lawfulness of underlying arrest	
necessary	155
elements.....	155
resolution of charges resulting from underlying arrest	
irrelevant	155
Rules of Criminal Procedure	
41(c); court can consider only affidavit itself and testimony	
sworn, recorded, or taken contemporaneously by a court	
reporter, not subsequent testimony of affiant or issuing	
magistrate	9
1507; dismissal without hearing; opinion and order entered	
after argument satisfies notice requirement	265
search and seizure; validity of foreign search; foreign law	
controls.....	9

sentencing	
maximum sentence after probation revocation may not exceed the original sentence only where first sentence was suspended pending probation	233
re-sentencing; after probation revocation; court retains its options and new sentence not illegal merely because it exceeds the original's maximum sentence	233
revocation of intermediate punishment allows court to have same sentencing options as at initial sentencing.....	233
verdict against weight of evidence; standard to grant new trial	285
witnesses	
powers of observation, memory, and recall; rulings in courtroom proceedings may depend on foundational facts regarding same	21
recantation testimony viewed with suspicion	193
sexual abuse claims made after lengthy delay; value of corroboration	33

D

Damages

compensatory; purpose	115
punitive; if complaint establishes legal basis for recovery, challenge to same by preliminary objection not proper	251

Demurrer

definition	115
standard to sustain	169, 251, 115

District Attorneys

statements constituting reversible error	
elements	135, 155
not every unwise or unwarranted remark requires new trial	135, 155

District Courts

jurisdiction concurrent with, not independent of, court of common pleas'	81
--	----

Divorce

action is personal to party and dies with him/her	205
marital residence; award of rental value and preservation expenses of same within court's discretion.....	61
master's report	
credibility findings upheld absent abuse of discretion	61
influence upon court	61
recommendations only advisory to court	61
pensions; contribution after separation not marital property.....	61
property and marital settlement agreements	
governed by contract law.....	205
survive a party	205

Driver's Licenses

Driver's License Compact; MD probation before judgment not a conviction to support PA license revocation	247
suspension; Vehicle Code Section 1532(a)(1); PennDOT's burden	101

E

Easements

implication	
distinguished from easement by necessity	183
tests	183
necessity	
distinguished from easement by implication	183
elements	183
when implied	183
possession; defined	183
prescription; elements	183
right of ancient origin; proponent's burden	183

Ejectment

distinguished from action to quiet title	183
--	-----

Eminent Domain

judicial review; role	147
presumption that action is proper	147
condemnee's burden	147

Employer-Employee

employer as defendant; employer's liability; Comparative Negligence Act vs. Workmen's Compensation Act.....	25
indemnity; employer's liability; express waiver necessary to meet requirements of Workmen's Compensation Act	25
Workmen's Compensation Act— see separate topic, below	

Equity

petition to open judgment is an equitable action.....	245
---	-----

Evidence

admission of evidence is within the court's discretion	257
alcohol consumption; recklessness or carelessness at issue; intoxication vs. mere consumption of alcohol.....	91
hearsay	
course of action explanation; court's discretion to admit	5
statements for medical treatment; exception does not include those made concerning causation of injury.....	257
standard to admit; balance relevance against prejudice	91

F

Fraud

elements	297
----------------	-----

I

Incapacitated Persons

guardianship not necessary where valid, durable power of attorney present	199
standing to raise issue	141

Indemnity

employer-employee; express waiver necessary to meet requirements of Workmen's Compensation Act	25
manufacturer's failure to inspect; no support in PA law for indemnification	39

product liability; assembler or supplier whose liability is premised solely on incorporation of defective component is entitled to indemnification from defective-component supplier.....	39
Insurance	
private motor vehicle; tort option elected by named insured applies to all insureds not named under another policy.....	103
Insurance Companies	
bad faith claim	
clause in policy barring assignment.....	1
insured's right to assign	1
J	
Judges	
disqualification; asserting party's burden	219
recusal; awareness of improper evidence does not require recusal	219
Judgment	
petition to open	
is an equitable action	245
petitioner's burden	245
Judgment on the Pleadings	
standard to grant	89
Juries	
evidence	
jury is free to believe all, some, or none of testimony	95
limitation	95
powers to compromise assessment of causal negligence and amount of damages	95
personal	
assertant's burden when party successfully sustains personal-jurisdiction challenge	125
due process; test.....	125
how to challenge	125
minimum contacts; test	125
types applying to foreign defendants.....	125
subject to PA Longarm Statute and 14th Amendment's Due Process Clause.....	125
L	
Lessor-Lessee	
indemnity; express waiver necessary to meet requirements of Workmen's Compensation Act	25
M	
Marriage	
common-law marriage	
co-habitation; effect	71
contributing factors	71
elements	71

void/voidable marriage	
impediment; removal but no subsequent cohabitation; when	
marriage void.....	141
Mistrial	
standard to grant	135, 155
District Attorney's comments	
not every unwise or unwarranted remark requires a	
new trial	135, 155
requirements for reversible error	135, 155
Mortgages	
foreclosure after assignment not allowed if assignment document	
allows only action to collect debt	85
Motions	
in limine; definition and purpose.....	103
Motor Vehicles	
automobiles; elements of ownership	13
insurance	
private motor vehicle; tort option elected by named insured	
applies to all insureds not named under another policy	103
Vehicle Code	
Section 1532(a)(1); license revocation; PennDOT's burden	101
Section 3353; municipal authority's powers	77
Municipal Authorities	
discretionary decisions; standard of review.....	147
powers under Vehicle Code Section 3353	77
N	
Negligence	
animals; vicious propensities, not necessarily acts, give notice to	
owner; no "one free bite" rule in PA	223
Comparative Negligence Act; vs. Workmen's Compensation Act;	
employer as defendant	25
jury's powers to compromise assessment of causal negligence	
and damages.....	95
per se	
plaintiff's burden	223
proximate cause	
defined	223
statutory violation must be a substantial factor in causing	
injury.....	223
question of law, generally	223
where found and not found	223
Workmen's Compensation Act; vs. Comparative Negligence Act;	
employer as defendant	25
P	
Personal Property	
standard to determine ownership.....	13
storage costs; right to claim	113

Pleadings	
complaint	
conditions to meet	297
court's discretion to review for sufficient detail	251
function	251
requirement of conciseness and specificity	297
broadly interpreted	297
Post-Conviction Relief Act	
dismissal or joinder; attorney's failure to compel or seek	
not cognizable	265
guilty plea; not generally in purview	
exceptions	193
petitioner's burden	193
ineffective assistance of counsel	
attorney presumed effective; standard of review	265
claim not waived in subsequent proceedings if petitioner	
alleges subsequent counsel ineffective for not pursuing it ..	265
dismissal or joinder; failure to compel or seek not	
cognizable	265
petitioner's burden	129, 265
jurisdiction	
one year to file	193
possibility of recantation does not lift time bar to file	193
petitioner's burden	129
purpose	129
recantation; possibility does not lift time bar to file	193
Rule of Criminal Procedure 1507; dismissal without hearing;	
opinion and order entered after argument satisfies notice	
requirement	265
Power of Attorney	
agency law controls	179
guardianship not necessary where valid, durable power of	
attorney present	199
exception	199
Preliminary Objections	
impertinent or scandalous matter; defined	169
Product Liability	
assembler or supplier whose liability is premised solely on	
incorporation of defective component is entitled to	
indemnification from supplier of defective component	39
defendant responsible for pro rata share of damages	39
lethal propensity; reasonable knowledge of same; manufacturer's	
liability for failure to warn of same	91
manufacturers; failure to inspect; no support in PA law for	
indemnification	39
seller or assembler of component parts strictly liable to plaintiff	
as a social adjustment	39
social adjustment; defined	39

strict liability	
elements	91
plaintiff's burden	91
seller or assembler of component parts strictly liable to	
plaintiff as a social adjustment	39

Q

Quiet Title

action in ejectment distinguished	183
plaintiff not necessarily required to be in possession	183
restrictions on use not favored and not extended by implication ..	237
trespass; whether individual is trespasser, licensee, or invitee is	
usually for jury.....	223

R

Real Property

adverse possession	
elements	119
grantees of life tenant and remaindermen; when right of	
action accrues	119
initial non-adverse entry; break in privity required.....	119
easements	
characteristics.....	237
defined	237
grantor reserves all incidents of ownership not conveyed.....	237
implication	
distinguished from easement by necessity	183
necessity	
distinguished from easement by implication	183
elements.....	183
when implied	183
possession; defined	183
prescription; elements	183
right of ancient origin; proponent's burden.....	183
trespass; whether individual is trespasser, licensee, or invitee is	
usually for jury.....	223

Res Judicata—see under Civil Procedure, above

Restatement of Torts 2d

Section 674; wrongful use of civil proceedings	251
Section 681; allows regular and punitive damages for emotional	
distress in claim of wrongful use of civil proceedings	251
wrongful use of civil proceedings (see also under Torts, below)	
“initiation of proceedings”	
defined	251
PA statutory law and Restatement of Torts 2d in accord	251
PA statutory law co-exists	251
Section 674	251
Section 681	251

S

Statutory Interpretation

presumption of effectiveness; court must consider all sections of statute.....	81
--	----

Summary Judgment

movant's burden.....	13
Rule of Civil Procedure 1035.2	
multiple motions allowed; limitation.....	25
when to file	25
Rule of Civil Procedure 1035.3	
plaintiff may supplement record after motion filed.....	39
standard to grant	13, 39, 292

T

Torts—see also separate headings for specific torts

collateral source of recovery or payment immaterial to	
defendant's position	275
policy explained	275
compensatory damages; purpose	115
contract; when breach supports action in tort	45
personal injury	
medical care; plaintiff entitled to recover reasonable value of same	275
minor victim	
gives rise to two distinct causes of action.....	275
parent's claim not derivative of child's	275
“serious impairment of bodily function”	
plaintiff's burden; must show sufficient injury and bodily impairment, not just fact of injury, to avoid summary judgment	292
two inquiries; discussion.....	292
remedies; purpose	115
Restatement of Torts 2d; see above	
trespass; whether individual is respasser, licensee, or invitee is usually for jury.....	223
Workmen's Compensation benefits; lump-sum;	
child support obligation	
are income for computing child support payments.....	303
court has discretion to determine most-appropriate method for imputing the award as such.....	303
wrongful use of civil proceedings	
damages; emotional distress; regular and punitive damages available.....	251
district magistrates; also applies to actions before same.....	251
elements	251
emotional distress; damages; regular and punitive available ..	251
“initiation of proceedings”; PA statutory law and Restatement of Torts 2d in accordance	251
PA statutory law and Restatement of Torts 2d co-exist.....	251

probable cause; determination of same for court if no disputed facts; otherwise, determination must await resolution of factual issues	251
withdrawal of former suit; compromise	
defendant required to plead fact of same	251
not a favorable termination	251
whether defendant's withdrawal of same is favorable to plaintiff depends upon circumstances of withdrawal	251
Trespass	
whether individual is trespasser, licensee, or invitee is usually for jury	223
W	
Wills	
confidential relationship	
kinship; more than mere presence of same required	17
matter of law; when	17
power of attorney; undue influence; presence at dictation or scrivening of will	17
question of fact; when	17
transaction	
proponent's burden once confidential relationship found	17
voidable if confidential relationship found	17
undue influence; power of attorney; presence at dictation or scrivening of will	17
revocation	
relative revocation; defined	141
standing to contest	141
undue influence; confidential relationship; power of attorney; presence at dictation or scrivening of will	17
Witnesses	
cross-examination	
criminal case; extends beyond direct examination and includes the right to examine the witness on any facts tending to refute inferences or deductions arising from matters testified to on direct examination	21
interest or bias	135
expert; reports; fair scope rule; purpose	39
powers of observation, memory, and recall; rulings in courtroom proceedings may depend on foundational facts regarding same	21

Workmen's Compensation Act

employer

- defendant; case law would become pertinent if more than proportional liability is considered; although the Comparative Negligence Act imposes general liability on all tortfeasors, Section 481 of The Workmen's Compensation Act would limit a defendant's exposure, allowing pro tanto diminishment of an award in the same manner as with a released tortfeasor 25
- indemnification; for an employer to be held liable in indemnification for injuries to its own employees caused by the negligence of the indemnitee there must be an express provision for this contingency in the indemnification clause; the absence of a provision in the hold-harmless clause that lessee would indemnify lessor against the negligence of lessor in a claim by the lessor's employee requires the conclusion that the clause does not meet the requirements of the Workmen's Compensation Act concerning express waiver 25
- exclusive remedy when applicable 25
- lump sum award; child support obligation
 - considered income since at least 1981 303
 - court has discretion to determine most-appropriate method for imputing such as income 303
- Section 481 25

Wrongful Use of Civil Proceedings—see under Torts, above

Z

Zoning

- factual findings; if inadequate, court should remand for further finding of essential facts 57
- nonconforming use
 - abandonment; proponent's burden..... 161
 - proponent's burden 161
- review; standard if no additional evidence before trial court..... 161