

Adams County
LEGAL JOURNAL

Containing Opinions handed down in the 51st Judicial District and by
the Judges of that District sitting in other Districts.

VOLUME XLIV

Reported by
JOHN W. PHILLIPS, ESQ.
Gettysburg, Pennsylvania

Published by
ADAMS COUNTY BAR ASSOCIATION
Gettysburg, Pennsylvania

Distributed by
WM. W. GAUNT & SONS, INC.
Holmes Beach, Florida

LEGAL JOURNAL

Copyright 2003

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS CARD NO. 61-16583

Judges of the 51st
Judicial District
Adams County

HONORABLE JOHN D. KUHN
HONORABLE ROBERT G. BIGHAM
HONORABLE MICHAEL A. GEORGE

Gettysburg

1917

1918

1919

TABLE OF CASES

REPORTED IN THIS VOLUME

	Page
Adams Abstract et al, Himmelreich vs.	68
Aldridge, Commonwealth vs.	164
Angelozzi, Pavex vs.	254
Atwell, Commonwealth vs.	276
Bange et al vs. Mt. Pleasant Township	21
Baum, PennDOT vs.	186
Becker	
(vs.) Czapp et al	273
Heiges vs.	160
vs. Czapp et al	273
Beloff, Commonwealth vs.	121
Bucher, Swords vs.	229
CACO Three, Inc. vs. Huntington Twp.	243
Commonwealth vs. Aldridge	164
Commonwealth vs. Atwell	276
Commonwealth vs. Beloff	121
Commonwealth vs. Costella et al	26
Commonwealth vs. Gochenour	168
Commonwealth vs. Harrison	29
Commonwealth vs. Lee	147
Commonwealth vs. O'Connor et al	38
Commonwealth vs. Sanchez	24
Commonwealth vs. Vanmetre	34
Commonwealth vs. Whitson	143
Costella et al, Commonwealth vs.	26
Cumberland Twp., Kern vs.	153
Czapp et al, Becker vs.	273
Davies Ins. et al, Rhoads vs.	1
(Pennsylvania) Department of Transportation vs. Baum	186
Diveglia vs. Smith	88, 192
Doe (, John) et al, U.S. Bank vs.	197
Doe (, John) et al, Wells Fargo et al vs.	199
Duraclean vs. Flanary	105
Ennis Consulting vs. Environmentally Safe Products et al	101
Environmentally Safe Products et al, Ennis Consulting vs.	101
Fairfield Area School District et al vs. The National Organization for Children et al	8
Fischer, Snyder vs.	250

TABLE OF CASES
 RECEIVED BY THE COURT

	Page
Flanary, Duraclean vs.	105
Fluke vs. Fluke.....	125
Gelcor vs. Straban Twp.....	177
Germany Twp. et al, Sines et al vs.	171
Gochenour, Commonwealth vs.....	168
Harrison, Commonwealth vs.	29
Heiges vs. Becker	160
High, Peoples State Bank vs.....	204
Himmelreich vs. Adams Abstract et al	68
Huntington Twp., CACO Three, Inc. vs.....	243
John Doe et al, U.S. Bank vs.	197
John Doe et al, Wells Fargo et al vs.	199
Kern vs. Cumberland Twp.	153
Kimple et al, Morret vs.....	114
Koutch et al, Williams vs.	83
Larsen vs. Larsen.....	65
Lee, Commonwealth vs.	147
(Liquor Control Board) Tassou Appeal	214
Mason, Tyler vs.....	91
McFarland et al, Shore vs.....	208
Morret vs. Kimple et al	114
Mt. Pleasant Township, Bange et al vs.....	21
(The) National Organization for Children et al, Fairfield Area School District et al vs.	8
O'Connor et al, Commonwealth vs.	38
Pavex vs. Angelozzi	254
PennDOT vs. Baum	186
(Pennsylvania Liquor Control Board) Tassou Appeal	214
Peoples State Bank vs. High	204
Plank vs. Varish et al	98
Rhoads vs. Davies Ins. et al	1
Rovner et al, Stillwaggon vs.....	129

	Page
Sanchez, Commonwealth vs.	24
Shore vs. McFarland et al.	208
Sines et al vs. Germany Twp. et al.	171
Sizemore, Tyson vs.	109
Smith, Diveglia vs.	88, 192
Snyder vs. Fischer.	250
Stillwaggon vs. Rovner et al.	129
Straban Twp., Gelcor vs.	177
Swords vs. Bucher.	229
Tassou Appeal.	214
The National Organization for Children et al, Fairfield Area School District et al vs.	8
Tyler vs. Mason.	91
Tyson vs. Sizemore.	109
U.S. Bank vs. John Doe et al.	197
Vanmetre, Commonwealth vs.	34
Varish et al, Plank vs.	98
Wells Fargo et al vs. John Doe et al.	199
Whitson, Commonwealth vs.	143
Williams vs. Koutch et al.	83

INDEX

VOLUME 44

2002-2003

A

Abatement--see Civil Procedure

Attorneys

Page

attorney-client privilege--see Privileges	
attorney's fees--see fees, this topic	
client's crime or fraud--see duty to disclose..., this topic	
Commonwealth Attorney's Act--see Criminal Law	
district attorneys--see Criminal Law	
duty to disclose to tribunal to avoid assisting client's crime or fraud	34
fees	
default judgment; award improper (here) as neither authorized by statute nor written agreement of parties.....	250
mandamus action; recovery by plaintiff; standard to award	21
recovery; not recoverable absent statute or contract	21
malpractice--see also Professions	
actual loss required	129
expert testimony necessary to establish (general rule)	129
exception (general rule).....	129
plaintiff's burden	129
recovery; actual loss required	129
privileges--see separate topic	

C

Charter School Law--see Education Law

Civil Procedure

abatement; discussed	8
affirmative defenses; preliminary objections may not raise certain issues or affirmative defenses (specific examples given)	254
collateral estoppel--see separate topic	
complaint--see pleadings; complaint, this topic	
default judgment	
attorney's fees; improper (here) as neither authorized by statute nor by written agreement of parties.....	250
mere ignorance or inexperience in legal matters is not a justification for default	250
petition to open	
petitioner's burden.....	250
promptness; factors in court's analysis of petitioner's promptness in filing petition.....	250
demurrer	
cannot aver facts not apparent from face of challenged pleading	254
common-law demurrer is similar to motion for judgment on the pleadings.....	208
consequences	109

(effect of) doubt about sustaining motion	114
explained and effects	114
question presented	114
effect of doubt about sustaining motion	114
discovery	
court's discretion and limit	129
violation; sanctions	129
factors to consider to impose	129
equity--see separate topic	
(motion for) judgment on the pleadings	
contracts; exculpatory clause; when motion not granted	208
(common-law) demurrer is similar	208
(when to) file	208
items considered	208
standard to decide	208
(motion for) summary judgment; distinguished	208
judicial estoppel--see separate topic	
jurisdiction; lack; discussion and consequence	105
lis pendens; discussed	8
local rules	
binding on parties	88, 197
dismissal appropriate sanction for non-compliance	197
generally.....	197
violation; available sanctions and standard to apply	88
(motion for) more-specific pleading (by preliminary objection);	
issue raised.....	109
“motion for _____” is listed in this topic by subject of motion	
parol evidence rule--see also extrinsic evidence, oral representations,	
parol evidence, and parol evidence rule, each in Contracts	
may raise by preliminary objections	254
parties--see Equity and also Real Property	
pleadings: multiple sub-topics covered below after general	
considerations; organized alphabetically by sub-topic; for	
example: pleadings; averments follows pleadings; amendment	
concision; pleadings must be concise	254
court must not place procedure and form over or equal to the	
substantive objectives of the litigation	254
generally.....	254
pleadings; amendment	
disallowed if prejudice to either party results	98
prejudice; expenses of time and money alone prior to	
motion to amend insufficient to show prejudice	98
discretionary with court.....	1, 88
but should be liberally granted	88
impermissible remedy; amendment not permitted to seek	1
standard to grant	1
statute of limitations has run	
not permitted	
if new cause of action stated.....	1
if new remedy sought but not supported by	
underlying facts in original pleading	1

permitted	1
if no new cause of action stated; when new cause of action not stated	1
focus for court	1
(right to recover) punitive damages is incidental to the underlying cause of action; request for same does not constitute a cause of action in and of itself	1
title of new count immaterial	1
if previous averments only amplified	1
pleadings; averments	
immaterial averments; court may strike if they create confusion.....	254
impertinent averments; court may strike if they create confusion.....	254
surplusage; generally, may treat as harmless and ignore; may strike if immaterial or impertinent averments create confusion.....	254
pleadings; complaint	
averments in complaint conflicting with attached exhibits; court's discretion	109
function	109
properly-pleaded statements of fact, not argumentative conclusions required; consequences of demurrer	109
pleadings; demurrer--see demurrer, this topic	
pleadings; exhibits	
averments in complaint conflicting with attached exhibits; court's discretion	109
pleadings; fraud--see Fraud	
pleadings; generally--see entries preceding pleadings; amendment, this sub-topic	
pleadings; immaterial averments--see pleadings; averments, this sub-topic	
pleadings; impertinent averments--see pleadings; averments, this sub-topic	
pleadings; insufficiency of allegations; standard to determine	160
pleadings; purpose; must be concise	254
pleadings; rules of pleading--see rules of pleading, this topic	
pleadings; surplusage--see pleadings; averments, this sub-topic	
pleadings; verification; where required and consequences for failure to do so	160
preliminary objections	
affirmative defenses; preliminary objections may not raise certain issues or affirmative defenses (specific examples given).....	254
dismissal of case; standard to grant objections	109
limitations as to what they may raise	254
mere denial of oral agreement's existence insufficient basis to grant defendant's preliminary objections	101
(in nature of) motion for more-specific pleading; issue raised	109

parol evidence rule; preliminary objections may raise	254
res adjudicata--see separate topic	
Rules of Civil Procedure	
1035.2(2)--see also summary judgment, this topic, and also	
Negligence--assumption of risk	229
1035.3	171
1035.4	229
3132	199
ejectment action; Rules allow an ejectment action to be	
initiated upon unknown parties in possession of the	
real property but mandate that such a person be	
joined as a party	197
rules of pleading; purpose and explanation	68
standing	
discussed	101
test	101
(motion for) summary judgment	
assumption of risk--see Rule of Civil Procedure 1035.2(2),	
this sub-topic, and also Negligence	
deposition testimony; extent of court's consideration	
when ruling	229
duty--see Rule of Civil Procedure 1035.2(2), this sub-topic	
(motion for) judgment on the pleadings; distinguished	208
movant's burden	229
negligence; assumption of risk; court considers as part of	
"no duty" analysis	229
Rule of Civil Procedure 1035.2(2) applies	229
non-movant	
burden	229
duty in response to motion	68
response to motion	
duty in response to motion	68, 171, 199, 229
failure to respond; consequences	171, 199
inappropriate response; consequences	199
insufficient response; consequences	68
Rule of Civil Procedure 1035.2(2)--see also Negligence--	
assumption of risk--summary judgment	
assumption of risk--see negligence, this sub-topic	
duty--see negligence, this sub-topic	
function of motion under Rule	229
(under Rule:) method to show lack of evidence on duty	
issue is to show assumption of risk as a matter	
of law	229
negligence; assumption of risk; court considers as part	
of "no duty" analysis	229
purpose of motion under Rule.....	229
standard to grant	68, 199, 208, 229
discussion of standard	208
unsupported assertions of conclusory allegations	
cannot create genuine issues of material fact	229

what court may consider	229
venue	
assignment; venue if plaintiff is assignee	204
breach of contract action--see Contracts	
Collateral Estoppel	
compared to	34
judicial estoppel	
res judicata	125
who may raise, against whom, and use as shield or sword.....	125
Commonwealth Attorney's Act--see Criminal Law	
Constitutional Law	
Article I, Section 8--see Pennsylvania Constitution, this topic	
Article III, Section 1--see Pennsylvania Constitution, this topic	
Article III, Section 3--see Pennsylvania Constitution, this topic	
Article III, Section 4--see Pennsylvania Constitution, this topic	
double jeopardy--see Criminal Law	
due process--see Criminal Law--witnesses...	
Enrolled Bill Doctrine; explained	38
equal protection	
essence	38
federal and Penna. constitutions analyzed by same	
standards	38
legislative classifications; where permitted	38
Fourth Amendment--see U.S. Constitution, this topic	
legislation	
Article III, Section 3; challenger's burden under this	
provision	38
challenge to constitutionality; challenger's burden	38
presumption that legislation is constitutional	38
legislative classifications--see equal protection, this topic	
overbreadth	
defined	38
standing	38
Pennsylvania Constitution	
Article I, Section 8.....	121
compared to U.S. Constitution, 4th Amendment	276
Article III, Section 1	38
Article III, Section 3	38
Article III, Section 4	38
search and seizure--see Criminal Law	
selective prosecution--see Criminal Law	
U.S. Constitution	
First Amendment; overbreadth, standing.....	38
Fourth Amendment	121
compared to Pennsylvania's requirements	276
vagueness; standard to determine in theory and application.....	38
Constructive Trust--see Equity	
Consumer Law--see Unfair Trade Practices and Consumer Protection Law	

Contracts	
acceptance; place of acceptance is where transaction occurs	204
accident--see parol evidence--admissible...	
adhesion contract; discussed	208
avoidance	
claim that contract "does not contain an agreement as he made it" insufficient to set aside a written agreement	254
"haste and excitement" invalid reason to set aside a written agreement	254
literate person who chooses not to read a document will receive no protection at equity or law	254
mutual mistake; when contract will be rescinded	254
breach	
damages; punitive damages not permitted.....	1
venue--see below, this topic	
consideration	
compliance with previously-valid agreement does not evidence consideration of a subsequent modification.....	254
oral agreement; subsequent oral modification of written agreement requires valid consideration.....	254
damages; breach of contract; punitive damages not permitted	1
exculpatory clause	
motion for judgment on the pleadings will not be granted if clause claimed unconscionable	208
requirements for enforceability	208
validity	208
extrinsic evidence--review also interpretation, oral representations, parol evidence, and parol evidence rule, each this topic	
written contract; integration clause; ambiguous terms; when extrinsic evidence admissible	254
limitation	254
fraud--see also parol evidence--admissible..., this topic, and Fraud defense of fraud--see Fraud	
implied contract--see Quantum Meruit	
integration	
defined	254
determination	254
integration clause; parol evidence; when admissible	254
matter of law for court.....	254
court's factors to determine.....	254
pre-requisites	254
parol evidence, when admissible	254
interpretation; contract with integration clause--review also extrinsic evidence, oral representations, parol evidence, and parol evidence rule, each this topic	
ambiguous terms	
extrinsic evidence may be admissible	254
limitation	254
parol evidence; when admissible	254
extrinsic evidence; when admissible	254
limitation	254

parol evidence; when admissible	254
unclear purpose; parol evidence admissible	254
mistake--see parol evidence--admissible..., this topic, and avoidance-- mutual mistake, this topic	
mutual mistake; rescission	254
oral representations--review also extrinsic evidence, interpretation, parol evidence, and parol evidence rule, each this topic	
merge into or are superseded by subsequent written contract..	254
exceptions	254
parol evidence--review also extrinsic evidence, interpretation, oral representations, and parol evidence rule, each this topic	
admissible	
contract has ambiguous terms or unclear purpose	254
limitation.....	254
to show fraud, accident, or mistake to vary a written contract's terms.....	254
to show oral agreements subsequent to a written contract	254
caveat	254
inadmissible	
presumptively barred if claim based on oral declaration or understanding of a subject a written contract	
addresses	254
purposes barred	254
to show prior or contemporaneous oral agreements, not subsequent ones	254
caveat	254
parol evidence rule--review also extrinsic evidence, interpretation, oral representations, and parol evidence, each this topic	
explained and effect	
exceptions	254
preliminary objections may raise.....	254
payment; where presumed to be performed	204
(place of) performance; presumed that payment under a contract is due at plaintiff's residence or business, absent	
contrary agreement	204
quantum meruit--see separate topic	
rescission (see also avoidance, this topic); mutual mistake	254
transaction	
making of a contract constitutes a transaction	204
occurs where offer accepted	204
unjust enrichment; inapplicable when relationship founded on written agreement or express contract	254
venue	
failure to perform obligation in a county is an "occurrence" that establishes venue	204
"occurrence"; failure to perform obligation in a county is an occurrence that establishes venue	204
proper in county where payment is due in a breach-of- contract action alleging failure to make payment.....	204

Conversion--see Torts

Courts

Common Pleas

jurisdiction	105
compared to that of District Courts.....	105
exceptions	105

District Courts--see separate topic

Enrolled Bill Doctrine; explained	38
---	----

judicial estoppel--see separate topic

legislatures; judicial intrusion into legislature's prerogatives; extent	38
---	----

separation of powers--see legislatures, this topic

venue--see Civil Procedure

Criminal Law

42 Pa.C.S.A.

Section 7002(b)--see ignition interlock, this topic

Section 9760--see sentence and sentencing, this topic

affidavit (search warrant)--see search and seizure--warrant, this topic alias; use is relevant to identification and consciousness of guilt..	24
--	----

anonymous tip--see search and seizure--warrant--affidavit, this topic

Article I, Section 8--see search and seizure, this topic, and also

 Constitutional Law--Pennsylvania Constitution

chain of custody--see evidence, this topic

collateral civil consequence of criminal conviction--see Minors

Commonwealth Attorney's Act; application and Attorney General's discretion	276
---	-----

consciousness of guilt

 alias--see separate sub-topic

insufficient by itself to prove guilt; is only a factor to consider	24
--	----

corpus delicti rule

 closely-related crime exception--see exception this sub-topic

Commonwealth's burden	143
-----------------------------	-----

exception (closely-related crime); explained.....	143
---	-----

applies even if offenses of different grades; discussion	143
--	-----

custody--see sentence and sentencing, this topic

district attorney

 Commonwealth Attorney's Act--see separate sub-topic

disqualification; requirements	276
--------------------------------------	-----

double jeopardy--see also re-trial, this topic

jury unable to agree on some but not all charges; when re-trial on remaining charges allowed.....	276
--	-----

driving under the influence--see separate topic and also Driver's

 License--driving under the influence...

due process--see witnesses--leniency...-potential...this topic, and

 Constitutional Law

evidence; chain of custody

 admissibility

gaps in chain affect weight, not admissibility.....	29
---	----

standard to admit	29
-------------------------	----

defined	29
gaps in chain affect weight, not admissibility	29
why and where required	29
expectation of privacy--see search and seizure, this topic	
Fourth Amendment--see search and seizure, this topic, and also Constitutional Law--U.S. Constitution	
guilt--see consciousness of guilt--this topic	
guilty plea--see plea (guilty), this topic	
identification	
alias--see separate sub-topic	
ignition interlock (42 Pa.C.S.A. Section 7002(b)); discussion	
whether a civil or criminal sanction	38
investigative stop; moving vehicle--see search and seizure, this topic	
jury poll; Rule of Criminal Procedure 1120(f)--see also mistrial, this topic	
required only upon party's request; reversible error for judge to refuse	276
minors--see separate topic	
mistrial--see also jury poll, this topic	
no requirement that jury members unanimously agree that deadlock is hopeless before a mistrial can be declared	276
PCRA (Postconviction Relief Act)	
defendant's burden	147
waiver, when excused; petitioner's burden	147
plea (guilty)	
collateral consequences; plea not invalid for court's failure to inform defendant of same	147
colloquy; six mandatory areas court must address; consequences of omission	147
requirements; must be voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently entered; test to review (totality of circumstances)	147
"totality of circumstances" test--see requirements, this sub-topic	
"voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently entered"--see requirements, this sub-topic	
withdrawal	
collateral consequences; plea not invalid for court's failure to inform defendant of same	147
defective colloquy allows withdrawal	147
Postconviction Relief Act--see PCRA this topic	
privacy (expectation of)--see search and seizure, this topic	
probable cause--see search and seizure--warrant, this topic	
re-trial--see also double jeopardy, this topic	
defendant incarcerated	
jury unable to reach verdict; trial must commence within 120 days from date jury dismissed	276
Rule of Criminal Procedure 600; trial must commence within 120 days of date of order granting new trial	276

trial must commence within 120 days of date of order granting new trial (Rule of Criminal Procedure 600)	276
jury unable to agree on some but not all charges; when re-trial on remaining charges allowed.....	276
time limit; defendant incarcerated jury unable to reach verdict; trial must commence within 120 days from date jury dismissed.....	276
trial must commence within 120 days of date of order granting new trial	276
Rules of Criminal Procedure	
600; see re-trial, this topic	276
1100 (now Rule of Criminal Procedure 600)--see Rule of Criminal Procedure 600, this sub-topic	
1120(f)--see jury poll, this topic	
sanctions--see sentence and sentencing, this topic	
search and seizure	
Article I, Section 8--see Pennsylvania's requirements, this sub-topic, and Constitutional Law--Pennsylvania Constitution expectation of privacy--see privacy (expectation of) this sub-topic	
Fourth Amendment--see also Constitutional Law--U.S. Constitution requirements; Pennsylvania's requirements compared; application	276
general searches barred in Pennsylvania	276
improperly-seized items and properly-seized items from same search--see suppression--improper seizure ..., this sub-topic	
investigative stop, moving vehicle; test	168
moving vehicle; investigative stop; test	168
Pennsylvania's requirements; compared to Fourth Amendment's; application.....	276
"plain view doctrine"--see also search and seizure--warrantless, this topic	
effect; allows seizure of objects not named in warrant; requirements	276
explained	121, 276
requirements	276
test	168
privacy (expectation of)	
controlling consideration.....	121
"totality of circumstances" test.....	121
explained	121
pavilion	121
test--see "totality of circumstances" test, this sub-topic	
"totality of circumstances" test	121
probable cause--see warrant, this sub-topic	
properly-seized items and improperly-seized items from same search--see suppression--improper seizure ..., this sub-topic	
suppression	

burden--see entry directly below	
Commonwealth has burden by preponderance of evidence that challenged evidence is admissible	276
improper seizure of items during otherwise-valid search does not taint search and seizure of proper items; only improper items, or their poisoned fruit, are suppressible	276
“totality of circumstances” test	
privacy (expectation of)--see above, this sub-topic	
search warrant; probable cause to issue--see warrant, this sub-topic	
warrant (warrantless searches treated separately, below)	
affidavit	
anonymous tip	
factors supporting probable cause to issue warrant	164
informant’s reliability must be established; factors establishing same	164
function	
magistrate must be able to determine if information is stale.....	164
probable cause must appear within four corners of affidavit	164
probable cause must appear within four corners	164
anonymous tip--see affidavit, this sub-topic	
probable cause to issue	
must appear within four corners of affidavit	164
test on review (totality of circumstances).....	164
totality of circumstances--see probable cause to issue--test...this sub-topic	
warrantless (searches with warrant treated separately, above)	
consent by third party; when search allowed	121
“plain view doctrine”--see also separate sub-topic explained	121
test	168
third-party’s consent; when search allowed	121
search warrant--see search and seizure--warrant, this topic	
selective prosecution; defendant’s burden; unequal application of criminal laws alone insufficient; separation of powers is basis for court’s non-interference absent constitutional violation	276
sentence and sentencing	
42 Pa.C.S.A. Section 9760; credit for time spent in “custody”	26
collateral civil consequence of criminal conviction--see minors, this sub-topic	
credit for time spent in custody--see custody, this sub-topic	
“custody”	
42 Pa.C.S.A. Section 9760; credit for time spent in custody	26
compared to imprisonment	26
examined	26

“imprisonment” compared	26
time spent in “custody” must be credited	26
minors; loss of operating privilege for underage drinking is a collateral civil consequence of criminal conviction, not part of criminal sentence	38
revocation	
Commonwealth’s burden.....	29
formality of proceeding.....	29
proceeding; formality of proceeding.....	29
sanction; civil versus criminal status; legislative intent controls, not sanction’s placement in statute book	38
time spent in “custody” must be credited	26
suppression--see search and seizure, this topic	
“totality of circumstances” test	
plea (guilty) entry--see plea (guilty), this topic	
privacy (expectation of)--see search and seizure, this topic	
search warrant; probable cause to issue--see search and seizure--warrant, this topic	
underage drinking--see Minors	
warrant--see search and seizure, this topic	
witnesses; leniency in return for testimony against defendant	
defendant entitled to explore; due process requires that any potential understanding between the prosecution and a witness must be revealed to jury	276

D

Damages

contracts; breach; punitive damages not permitted	1
conversion--see Torts	
fraud (intentional) alleged; punitive damages allowed	1
outrageous conduct required	1
punitive damages	
conversion; punitive damages allowed if conversion	
is outrageous	1
intentional fraud is outrageous conduct	1
fraud; intentional fraud; punitive damages allowed	1
jury question	1
not permitted in breach-of-contract action	1
request is not a separate cause of action	1
right to recover	
an element of damages	1
incidental to underlying cause of action	1

Debtor-Creditor

assignment	
assignee’s rights	204
venue if assignee is plaintiff	204
sheriff’s sale--see Real Property	

Discovery--see Civil Procedure

District Attorneys--see Criminal Law

District Courts and Magistrates

appeal; procedure and venue	105
jurisdiction compared to Common Pleas courts	105
Rules of Civil Procedure District Justices No. 1002	105
search warrant affidavit--see Criminal Law--search and seizure-- warrant--affidavit	

Divorce

domicile of serviceperson	65
equitable distribution decree; court's power to modify and source of authority.....	125
residency requirement	65
military service exception	65
serviceperson's domicile	65

Driver's License

42 Pa.C.S.A. Section 7002(b)--see Criminal Law--ignition interlock collateral civil consequence of criminal conviction--see Minors driving under the influence is a separate topic; treatment of suspension of operating privilege for refusing a blood test when suspected of driving under the influence immediately follows	
driving under the influence; suspension for blood test refusal burdens	
Dept. of Transportation's burden.....	186
licensee's, once Dept. meets its burden	186
Dept. of Transportation's burden	186
injuries precluding knowing and conscious refusal; type of testimony required.....	186
knowing and conscious refusal precluded by injury; type of testimony required.....	186
licensee's burden once Dept. of Transportation meets its burden	186
witnesses; knowing and conscious refusal precluded by injury; type of testimony required	186
ignition interlock--see Criminal Law	
minors--see separate topic	
suspension	
blood test refusal--see driving under the influence, this topic	
collateral civil consequence of criminal conviction--see Minors	
underage drinking--see Minors	
underage drinking; suspension--see Minors	
Driving Under the Influence--see also Driver's License--driving under the influence...	
42 Pa.C.S.A. Section 7002(b)--see Criminal Law--ignition interlock "actual physical control"	
test	143
more than presence behind wheel with motor running required; what else required	143
blood test; suspension of operating privilege for refusal of same--see Driver's License--driving under the influence; suspension...	

driver's license; suspension for refusal of blood test--see Driver's License--driving under the influence; suspension...	
ignition interlock--see Criminal Law	
operation of motor vehicle while under the influence; "reasonable grounds" for officer's belief in same; inquiry into "reasonable grounds"	186
officer may rely on information from third party in reaching conclusion whether reasonable grounds exist	186
"reasonable grounds" for officer's belief in defendant's operation of motor vehicle while under the influence; inquiry	186
officer may rely on information from third party in reaching conclusion whether reasonable grounds exist	186
suspension of operating privilege for refusing blood test--see Driver's License--driving under the influence; suspension...	
third party may provide information that officer may rely on in reaching conclusion whether there are "reasonable grounds" to believe that defendant operated a motor vehicle while under the influence	186

E

Easement--see Real Property

Education Law

Charter School Law

appeal of local school board's decision to grant application; statute is silent on permissibility of and procedure to appeal decision	8
applies only to brick and mortar institutions (court's belief) .. further caveat	8
"classroom space" interpreted	8

Ejectment--see also Landlord-Tenant and also Real Property

requirements to maintain action	199
---------------------------------------	-----

Equity

"clean hands doctrine" explained	91
constructive trust	
creation	114
discussion	114
underlying principle	114
estoppel; is an equitable doctrine	254
indispensable party--see parties, this topic	
judicial estoppel--see separate topic	
laches; is an equitable doctrine	254
parties	
requirement for all dispensable [indispensable?--Ed.] parties to be joined before court can grant relief	88
court's duty if parties fail to raise non-joinder of an indispensable party	88
"unclean hands"--see "clean hands doctrine", this topic	
unjust enrichment	
elements	109

inapplicable when relationship founded on written agreement
or express contract..... 254

Enrolled Bill Doctrine--see Constitutional Law

Evidence

criminal law; chain of custody--see Criminal Law--evidence
expert testimony on negligence--see Witnesses--negligence--expert
testimony
extrinsic evidence--see Contracts
negligence; expert testimony--see Witnesses--negligence
parol evidence--see Contracts

Experts--see Witnesses--expert

F

Family Law--see separate topics for Marriage and Divorce

Fraud

constructive trust--see Equity
damages; punitive damages allowed for intentional fraud 1
defense of fraud; requirement of pleadings raising defense 254
 bald assertion insufficient 254
elements 68
intentional fraud; damages; punitive damages allowed..... 1
plaintiffs' burden and standard of proof 68
pleadings
 form 83
 particularity required 83
standard of proof 68
Unfair Trade Practices and Consumer Protection Law;
 Section 2-01-2(4)(xxi); plaintiff must plead and prove
 common fraud 83

I

Injunction

easement; injunction is appropriate relief to restrain interference
 with use of same 192
mandatory injunction
 explained 91
 plaintiff's burden (generally) 91
preliminary injunction
 elements required to grant 8
 (against) organization..... 8
real property; invasion of right in real property;
 proponent's burden 192
right-of-way; injunction is appropriate relief to restrain interference
 with use of same 192
special injunction
 bond/security; requirement for plaintiff to post; when 91
 purpose and explanation 91
 security/bond; requirement for plaintiff to post; when 91
 standard to grant 91
 where appropriate 91

J

Judges

recusal	186
proponent's burden	186
(prior) prosecutorial participation alone insufficient; pre-judgment or bias required	186

Judicial Estoppel

purpose; compared to collateral estoppel and res adjudicata	34
---	----

Juries

jury poll; Rule of Criminal Procedure 1120(f)--see Criminal Law	
mistrial--see Criminal Law	

Jurisdiction--see Civil Procedure

L

Landlord-Tenant

(judgment in) ejectment; compliance with same a condition precedent to eviction.....	91
eviction	
conditions precedent	91
(judgment in) ejectment; compliance with same a condition precedent to eviction	91
Landlord and Tenant Law; compliance with Law a condition precedent to eviction	91
self-help eviction not condoned in Pennsylvania	91
Landlord and Tenant Law, eviction--see eviction, this topic	

Legislatures and Legislation

Enrolled Bill Doctrine; explained	38
equal protection; legislative classifications; where permitted	38
judicial intrusion into legislature's prerogative; extent	38
legislative classifications; equal protection; where classifications permitted	38
sanction; civil versus criminal status--see Criminal Law--sentence and sentencing--sanction	
separation of powers--see Courts--legislatures	
statutory interpretation--see separate topic	

Liquor

Liquor Control Board	
appeal by applicant; standard of review	214
"resort area" exception--see also regulation, this topic	
"actual need"; factors to consider and discussion.....	214
"actual need" broadly construed by courts;	
applicant's burden.....	214
applicant's burden	214
governmental boundaries do not restrict court;	
discussion of extent of area considered	214
regulation; purpose	214
Liquor Control Board; "resort area" exception; court must interpret in view of purpose of liquor regulation	214

Lis Pendens--see Civil Procedure

Local Rules--see Civil Procedure

M

Magistrates--see District Courts and Magistrates

Malpractice--see Professions

Mandamus

attorney's fees; recovery by plaintiff; standard to award 21

Marriage

loss of consortium--see Negligence

Minors

collateral civil consequence of criminal conviction; underage drinking; loss of operating privilege is a collateral civil consequence of criminal conviction, not part of criminal sentence 38

criminal sentence--see underage drinking, this topic

underage drinking; loss of operating privilege is a collateral civil consequence of criminal conviction, not part of criminal sentence 38

Motor Vehicle Law

driver's license--see separate topic

driving under the influence--see separate topic and also Driver's License--driving under the influence...

ignition interlock--see Criminal Law

investigative stop, moving vehicle--see Criminal Law--search and seizure

roads and highways--see Municipalities

Municipalities

conditional use appeal--see Municipality's Planning Code, this topic

land use appeal; see Municipality's Planning Code, this topic

Municipality's Planning Code--review also Zoning

conditional use appeal

time limit to decide application..... 153

effect of failure to timely decide..... 153

land use appeal; additional evidence

court's ability to consider and discretion to permit 243

party's burden to present..... 243

Political Subdivision Tort Claims Act

generally 171

roads and highways; when township not liable for injuries caused by dangerous conditions on PennDOT roads 171

township's non-liability for injuries caused by dangerous conditions on PennDOT roads; when 171

roads and highways--see Political Subdivision Tort Claims Act, this topic

sewers; no duty to provide; however, municipality may be liable if system negligently constructed or maintained..... 171

Municipality's Planning Code--see Municipalities

Negligence

amusement facilities--see assumption of risk, this topic	
assumption of risk--see also Civil Procedure--summary judgment-- Rule of Civil Procedure 1035.2(2)	
amusement facilities--see sporting events and amusement facilities, this sub-topic	
doctrine viable in Pa.	229
caveat and exceptions to caveat.....	229
“duty” analysis--see summary judgment, this topic	
“inherent” risk--see sporting events and amusement facilities, this sub-topic	
participants or spectators--see sporting events and amusement facilities, this sub-topic	
Restatement of Torts (Second)	
Section 496	229
Section 496 A	229
Comment c2; Pa. Supreme Court discussion of doctrine, application, and underlying policy	229
Section 496 C	229
Rule of Civil Procedure 1035.2(2)--see summary judgment, this sub-topic	
sporting events and amusement facilities; participants or spectators; “inherent” risk; Pa. Supreme Court discussion and application.....	229
summary judgment--see also Civil Procedure--summary judgment--Rule of Civil Procedure 1035.2(2) Rule of Civil Procedure 1035.2(2); purpose of motion and court’s analysis.....	229
duty of care; breach	
defendant must owe duty of care to plaintiff.....	229
duty must be recognized	68
elements	68
(negligent infliction of) emotional distress--see Torts	
evidence	
expert testimony	
standard to require.....	68, 129
where not required (general rule)	129
lay testimony; where allowed (general rule)	129
expert testimony--see evidence, this topic	
“inherent” risk--see assumption of risk, this topic	
intoxication; recklessness or carelessness at issue	
alcohol consumption; when admissible	229
threshold amount for admissibility	229
proof of intoxication is relevant.....	229
lay testimony--see evidence, this topic	
loss of consortium	
basis of claim plus discussion	129

cause of action is separate and distinct and personal to uninjured spouse	129
damages; trauma (emotional or mental) to uninjured spouse is not an element of damages	129
plaintiff's burden	129
trauma (emotional or mental) to uninjured spouse is not an element of damages	129
uninjured spouse	
cause of action is separate and distinct and personal to same	129
plaintiff's burden	129
trauma (emotional or mental) to same is not an element of damages	129
malpractice--see Professions	
negligent infliction of emotional distress--see Torts	
negligent practice by professional--see Professions--malpractice	
participants or spectators--see assumption of risk, this topic	
professional's negligent practice--see Professions--malpractice	
Restatement of Torts (Second)--see assumption of risk, this topic	
risk; "inherent" risk--see assumption of risk, this topic	
sporting events--see assumption of risk, sporting events and amusement facilities, this topic	
summary judgment--see assumption of risk, this topic	
witnesses	
expert--see evidence, this topic	
lay--see evidence--lay testimony..., this topic	

P

Parol Evidence--see Contracts

Parol Evidence Rule--see Contracts

Parties, dispensable and indispensable parties--see Equity

Pennsylvania Liquor Control Board--see Liquor--Liquor Control Board

Pleadings--see Civil Procedure

Political Subdivision Tort Claims Act--see Municipalities

Privileges

attorney-client; civil matter

attorney cannot testify to confidential communications from client and client cannot be compelled to disclose the same.....	273
---	-----

burden to show privilege is on party asserting it.....	273
once established, party seeking to overcome it has burden to prove applicable exception	273

challenge to privilege

burdens; if party asserting it establishes privilege, party seeking to overcome it has burden to prove applicable exception	273
---	-----

court's method to decide legitimate challenge	273
---	-----

in-camera review by court of documents at issue is appropriate method to decide legitimate challenge	273
--	-----

extent--see also notes, this sub-topic	
extends to hand-written notes relating to confidential communications between attorney and client.....	273
exceptions	273
is not absolute, unlike privilege for medical and psychological records	273
notes; attorney-client privilege extends to hand-written notes relating to confidential communications between attorney and client; purpose for note-taking immaterial; example and application	273
exceptions	273
overcoming privilege--see challenge to privilege, this sub-topic	
waiver	273
medical records; privilege is absolute	273
psychological records; privilege is absolute	273
Professions	
malpractice; expert testimony necessary to establish (general rule)	68, 129
exception (legal malpractice)(general rule)	129
privileges--see separate topic	
Promissory Estoppel	
explained	114
forebearance; omission by promisee to do whatever the promisor promised to do insufficient "forebearance" to create promissory estoppel	114
Q	
Quantum Meruit	
explained	114
generally.....	114
inapplicable if plaintiff fails to prove an express contract to pay a fixed compensation	114
R	
Real Property	
conditional use appeal--see Municipalities--Municipality's Planning Code	
easement--see also "right-of-way; interference", this topic	
injunction is appropriate relief to restrain interference with use of same	192
ejectment	
parties; unknown parties in possession of real property must be joined as parties	197
requirements to maintain action	199
sheriff's execution purchaser; ejectment is appropriate remedy to recover possession.....	199
unknown possessors of real property must be joined as parties	197
equitable interests; sheriff's sale; purchaser acquires every right debtor had regarding property; court interprets this to include equitable interests; discussion of holding otherwise	199
execution sale--see sheriff's sale, this topic	

improvements; Unfair Trade Practices and Consumer Protection Law; contract for construction of dock or boathouse at one's home qualifies for Act's protection	83
indispensable parties--see ejectment--parties, and "right-of-way; interference", each this topic	
injunction	
easement; injunction is appropriate relief to restrain interference with use of same	192
invasion of right in real property; proponent's burden	192
right-of-way; injunction is appropriate relief to restrain interference with use of same	192
land use appeal--see Municipalities	
non-conforming use (attached to real property)--see Zoning	
parties--see ejectment, this topic and "right-of-way; interference", each this topic	
right-of-way; interference--see also easement, this topic	
indispensable party--see parties, this sub-topic	
injunction is appropriate relief to restrain interference with use of right-of-way	192
parties; who is and is not indispensable	192
sheriff's sale	
challenge to completed sale--see also next sub-topic	
Pa. Rule of Civil Procedure 3132; failure to comply	199
procedure	199
purchaser acquires every right debtor had regarding property; court interprets this to include equitable interests; discussion of holding otherwise	199
challenge to completed sale after delivery of Sheriff's Deed;-- see also previous sub-topic	
only attacks possible	199
debtor's rights regarding property--see purchaser acquires..., this sub-topic	
ejectment is appropriate remedy to recover possession from sheriff's execution purchaser.....	199
equitable interests; purchaser acquires every right debtor had regarding property; court interprets this to include equitable interests; discussion of holding otherwise.....	199
Pa. Rule of Civil Procedure 3132; failure to comply with rule.....	199
purchaser acquires every right debtor had regarding property; court interprets this to include equitable interests; discussion of holding otherwise	199
subdivisions--see Statutory Interpretation--(local) subdivision...	
Unfair Trade Practices and Consumer Protection Law--see separate topic and also improvements, this topic	
zoning--see separate topic	

Remedies

damages--see separate topic and also specific causes of action	
money or property obtained without authorization; remedy	114
quantum meruit--see separate topic	

Res Adjudicata--see also res judicata	
compared to judicial estoppel	34
Res Judicata--see also res adjudicata	
collateral estoppel compared	125
defined	125
Restatement of Torts (Second)--see Negligence--assumption of risk	
Right-of-Way	
interference--see Real Property--right-of-way; interference	
Roads and Highways--see Municipalities	
Rules of Civil Procedure--see Civil Procedure	
Rules of Civil Procedure District Justices--see District Courts and Magistrates--Rules of Civil Procedure District Justices No. 1002	
Rules of Criminal Procedure--see Criminal Law	
Rules of District Justices--see District Courts and Magistrates--Rules of Civil Procedure District Justices No. 1002	

S

Sanctions	
civil versus criminal status--see Criminal Law--sentence and sentencing--sanction	
Schools--see Education Law	
Search and Seizure--see Criminal Law	
Sheriff's Sale--see Real Property	
Statutory Interpretation--see also Zoning--interpretation	
Statutory Construction Act	
local subdivision and zoning ordinances are construed according to its principles although it does not expressly apply	153
(local) subdivision ordinances are construed according to the Statutory Construction Act's principles although it does not expressly apply	153
words and phrases	
1 Pa.C.S.A. Section 1903	8
1 Pa.C.S.A. Section 1903(a)	153
1 Pa.C.S.A. Section 1921(b)	8
non-technical words and phrases, or wording not given a peculiar and appropriate meaning as defined by statute, must be considered according to common and approved usage	8
unambiguous words; court cannot disregard clear words that are free from ambiguity under the pretext of pursuing a statute's spirit.....	8
(local) zoning ordinances are construed according to the Statutory Construction Act's principles although it does not expressly apply	153
Subdivisions--see Statutory Interpretation--(local) subdivision...	

T

Torts

conversion	
damages; punitive damages allowed if conduct is outrageous	1
intentional fraud is outrageous conduct	1
defined	1
intent	
required intent defined	1
specific intent to commit a wrong not necessary	1
money may be subject	1
punitive damages allowed if conduct is outrageous	1
intentional fraud is outrageous conduct	1
negligence--see separate topic	
negligent infliction of emotional distress	
a negligence action	160
plaintiff's burden	160
Restatement of Torts (Second)--see Negligence--assumption of risk	

Trusts, constructive trust--see Equity

U

Unfair Trade Practices and Consumer Protection Law

Section 2-01-2(4)(xxi)(aka "catchall provision); action under this	
section is a common fraud action	83
"catchall provision"--see entry immediately above	
fraud prevention is underlying purpose	83
improvement to real property--see real property, this topic	
private civil action allowed; standing	83
purpose is fraud prevention	83
real property; improvement; contract for construction of dock or	
boathouse at one's home qualifies for act's protection	
standing; private civil actions allowed.....	83

Unjust Enrichment--see Equity

V

Venue--see Civil Procedure and also Contracts

W

Witnesses

agreement for testimony--see Criminal Law--witnesses...	
criminal case--see Criminal Law--witnesses...	
expert	
malpractice--see malpractice, this topic	
negligence	
standard to require expert testimony	68, 129
where not required (general rule)	129
lay; negligence; where lay testimony allowed (general rule)	129
leniency in return for testimony--see Criminal Law--witnesses...	
malpractice; expert testimony necessary to establish (general rule)	68, 129
exception (legal malpractice)(general rule)	129

negligence	
expert testimony	
standard to require	68, 129
where not required (general rule)	129
lay testimony; where allowed (general rule)	129
negligent practice by professional--see malpractice, this topic	
professional's negligent practice--see malpractice, this topic	

Z

Zoning--review also Municipality's Planning Code

application--see also decision, this topic	
board must decide within 45 days of last hearing or	
application deemed approved	153
"common and approved" usage--review interpretation--words, this topic	
conditional use appeal--see Municipalities--Municipality's Planning Code	
decision	
communication	
agent may communicate decision in place of	
board members	153
writing; board must communicate decision to applicant	
in writing.....	153
signatures; decision need not contain board members'	
signatures, or be accompanied by the usual written	
appurtenances of an opinion	153
(standard of) review if trial court takes no additional evidence	
(see also entry immediately below).....	153
standard of review with expanded terms (for re-phrased	
standard, see entry immediately above)	177
time; board must decide within 45 days of last hearing or	
application deemed approved	153
writing--see communication, this sub-topic	
hearing--see also decision, this topic	
board must decide within 45 days of last hearing or	
application deemed approved	153
interpretation--please review entire sub-topic	
"common and approved" usage--see words, this sub-topic	
dictionaries--see words--"common and approved" usage--	
this sub-topic	
grammar rules apply	153
language--review words, this sub-topic	
"letter of ordinance"--see words--common and approved...	
this sub-topic	
ordinance--see words, this sub-topic	
"plain, ordinary meaning"--see words--undefined terms,	
this sub-topic	
sensible construction applied.....	153
"spirit" of ordinance--see words--common and approved...--	
ordinance--letter..., this sub-topic	
"standard, ordinary, and general usage"--see words, this sub-topic	
Statutory Construction Act's principles are followed although	
it does not expressly apply	153

Section 1903(a)	153
terms--see words--undefined terms, this sub-topic	
undefined language--review words, this sub-topic	
undefined terms--see words, this sub-topic	
words	
common and approved usage given to words	153
dictionaries are a proper source to determine this	153
ordinance	
letter of ordinance not to be disregarded in	
pretext of pursuing its spirit when	
determining common and	
approved usage.....	153
read ordinance as a whole when determining	
common and approved usage.....	153
plain, ordinary meaning given undefined terms	153
doubt resolved in favor of landowner and least-	
restrictive use of land	153
standard, ordinary, and general usage meaning given	
to undefined terms	
undefined terms--review also words, this sub-topic	
plain, ordinary meaning applies and doubt must be	
resolved in favor of landowner and least-	
restrictive use of land	153
standard, ordinary, and general usage	
meaning applies	153
land use appeal--see Municipalities--Municipality's Planning Code	
language--review interpretation, this topic	
municipalities--see separate topic	
Municipality's Planning Code--see Municipalities	
non-conforming use attached to real property	
abandonment	
elements	177
evidence	177
ownership alone not determinative	177
proponent's burden	177
owner enjoys vested property right in non-conforming use	
attached to real property	177
(vested) property right in non-conforming use attached to	
real property; owner enjoys same	177
real property; owner enjoys vested property right in non-	
conforming use attached to real property	177
ordinance--see interpretation--words--common... , this topic	
"plain, ordinary meaning"--see interpretation--words, this topic	
review--see decision, this topic	
standard of review--see decision, this topic	
"standard, ordinary, and general usage"--see interpretation--words	
this topic	
Statutory Construction Act; local zoning and subdivision ordinances	
are construed according to its principles although it does not	
expressly apply	153

subdivisions--see Statutory Construction Act, this topic
terms--review interpretation, this topic
undefined language--review interpretation this topic
undefined terms--see interpretation--words, this topic
words--see interpretation, this topic